

## 資料

## 介護者支援の国際比較関係外国文献

三 富 紀 敬

## 紹介に当って

ここに紹介するのは、介護者を直接の対象にする支援策に関する国際比較文献である。

介護者とその負担に関する支援は、少なくとも日本に関する限り要介護者を直接の対象にするサービスを以ってよしとする傾向が強く、介護者を直接の対象にする支援策に関する限り介護休暇を唯一の例外として一般的な制度に欠けると共に、研究者においてもそうしたことに特段の異議を唱えない傾向が強い。介護者手当に関しては、国連・女性の地位委員会による包括的な制度化提案がなされているにもかかわらず、制度化に拒否的な態度を示す研究者も少なくない。これに対して欧米諸国においては、要介護者に対するサービスと並んで介護者を直接の対象にする政策が広く採用され、研究者はもとより行政機関や民間非営利団体による国際比較の作業も少なくない。この政策体系には、介護者を対象にするサービスと共に介護者手当なども含まれる。これは、北欧諸国においてもしかりである。

筆者は、こうした理解を拠り所に『イギリスのコミュニティケアと介護者—介護者支援の国際的展開—』（ミネルヴァ書房、2008年）を取りまとめたところである。

ここに紹介する文献は、本来ならばこの拙著において外国文献一覧の中で紹介をするべきところである。しかし、拙著の「まえがき」でも触れたように他の外国文献と併せていかにも膨大な数になることから、そうした扱いを諦めざるを得なかった。

介護者の担う労働を含むケアワークあるいはケアワーカーに関する国際比較研究は、欧米諸国において近年いかにも活発に展開される。しかし、日本の現状を振り返るならば、福祉労働論あるいは社会福祉労働論に示されるように国際的な視野から見ても実に長い研究史を誇りながら、外国のケアワークあるいはケアワーカー研究に関しての蓄積はいかにも乏しい。拙著『イギリスの在宅介護者』（ミネルヴァ書房、2000年）、同『欧米のケアワーカー—福祉国家の忘れられた人々—』（ミネルヴァ書房、2005年）が数少ない作業と評せざるを得ない状況である。こうした結果は、少なくとも介護者支援に関する限り、上に述べた事情と無縁ではあるまい。

近年、漸く新しい動きが確認される。松本勝明氏を代表者にする共同研究『介護者の確保育成

策に関する国際比較研究』(厚生労働科学研究費補助金、平成19年度総括・分担研究報告書、平成20年3月、1-253頁)が、それである。この共同研究による介護者との表現は、有償の介護労働者と無償の介護者との双方を意味する。諸外国においては、ケアワークと題して問題に迫る場合有償の労働に止まらず無償の労働をも視野に収めて検討する傾向にあることから、そうした動向を読み取った上での課題設定と推察される。福祉国家類型論とこれを積極的に学び取った上で成された介護労働に関する国際比較研究の成果を肯定的に評価した上で調査研究の対象(ドイツ、フィンランド、イタリア及びアメリカの4カ国)を定め、独自の調査も踏まえながら研究を進めておられる。この試みは優れて積極的であり、次年度以降における作業の一段の進展が期待される。こうした作業の広がりを期待したいと思うところである。

日本国内においてもこうした新しい動向が確認され、また、介護者支援の国際比較に関する作業が上の4カ国に止まらず2桁を数える国々で行われる。しかも、国際比較の作業は、国際機関や国際レベルの諸団体などによっても広く手掛けられる。国際的な団体として影響力の少ないユーロケアラー(Eurocarers、2004年設立)が、ヨーロッパ8カ国を対象に国際比較研究(計画期間2008年3月-2009年12月)に着手したことも新しい動きである。これらを視野に収めるとき、介護者支援に関する国際比較の到達点を正当に踏まえる必要は、大きい。

以下に紹介の文献は、主に報告書や著書として公刊されたものであり、雑誌論文として公表の文献は3点を除いて掲載していない。雑誌論文として公表の成果についても包括的に把握するならば、自ずとその数は多くなると考えられる。

A. Evers, M. Pijl, C. Ungerson and als, Payments for care, a comparative overview, Avebury, 1994.

Alice Ho and als, A Look at working-age caregivers' roles, health concerns, and need for support, Issue Brief, The Commonwealth Fund, August 2005.

Alzheimer's Disease International, Help for caregivers, Alzheimer's Disease International, 1994.

Ann Marie Halpenny and Robbie Gilligan, Caring before their time? research and policy perspectives on young carers, Barnardos' National Children's Resource Centre and Children's Research Centre, 2004.

Ann V. Salvage, Qui prendra soin d'eux? perspectives d'avenir de l'aide familiale aux personnes âgées dans l'Union européenne, Fondation Européenne pour l'Amélioration des Conditions de Vie et de Travail, 1996.

Anne Goodhead and Janet McDonald, Informal caregivers literature review, a report prepared

- for the National Health Committee, Victoria University of Wellington, 2007.
- Anne Martin-Mattews and Judith E. Phillips, *Aging and caring at the intersection of work and home life, blurring the boundaries*, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 2008.
- Anne Montgomery, *Assessment of family caregivers: an international comparison across six countries*, in Family Caregiver Alliance, *Caregivers assessment: voices views from the field*, Vol. II, FCA, 2006.
- Anne Montgomery and Lynn Friss Feinberg, *The Road to recognition: international review of public policies to support family and informal caregiving, policy brief*, Family Caregiver Alliance, 2003.
- Annie Fouquet, *La Famille, espace de solidarité entre generations, conférence de la famille 2006*, République Française, 2006.
- Ariane Hegewisch and Janet C. Gornick, *Statutory routes to workplace flexibility in cross-national perspective*, Institute for Women's Policy Research, 2008.
- Audit Commission, *Support for carers of older people, independence and well-being 5*, Audit Commission, 2004.
- Australian Government, Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs, *Young carers research project: final report*, a Carers Association of Australia project funded by the Australian Government Department of Family and Community Services, Australian Government, FaHCSIA, 2002.
- Brian Munday and Peter Ely, *Social care in Europe*, Harvester Wheatsheaf, 1996.
- Brigid Barron, *Human resources in long-term care*, Eurocarers, 2008.
- Canadian Caregiver Coalition, *Caregivers: essential partners in care, festival of international conference on caregiving, disability, aging and technology FICCDAR, June 16-19, 2007 Toronto, Canada, summary of proceedings*, Canadian Caregiver Coalition, 2007.
- Care for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century, *Review and research and international case studies, in Care for the 21<sup>st</sup> century, The Future of unpaid care in Scotland, appendices 1-5*, Scottish Executive, 2006.
- Carers Association of SA Inc, *Children as carers, an overview of literature and projects on children as carers*, Carers Association of SA Inc, 2001.
- Caroline Glendinning, *Support for carers of older people-some intranational and national comparisons, a review of the literature prepared for the Audit Commission*, Audit Commission, 2004.

- Caroline Glenninning and Eithne McLaughlin, *Paying for care: lessons from Europe*, HMSO, 1993.
- Caroline Glendinning and Peter A. Kemp, *Cash and care, policy challenges in the welfare state*, The Policy Press, 2006.
- The Centre for Social & Community Research, *A Review of counselling services, available to carers in Western Australia, final report for the Disability Services Commission*, Murdoch University, 2003.
- Charlotte Aakjaer, Marie Willumsen and Hans Hansen, *Payment for care, impact on the economic situation of the pensioner in Denmark, Sweden, Norway, Finland, Great Britain and Germany*, Social Forsknings Instituttet, 2006.
- Christine Bon, *Le Concept international de répit care ou soin de répit: une idée à développer et promouvoir en France pour accompagner la vie indépendante à domicile de personne en situation de handicap*, IRTS, 2003.
- Claire Cameron and Peter Moss, *Care work in Europe, current understandings and future directions*, Routledge, 2007.
- Clare Ungerson and Sue Yeandle, *Cash for care in developed welfare states*, Palgrave Macmillan, 2007.
- COFACE, *European charter for family carers, proposal*, COFACE, 2007.
- Commission on the Status of Women WHO, *Follow-up to the fourth world conference on women: emerging issues, trends and new approaches to issues affecting the situation of women or equality between women and men, older women and support systems: new challenges*, Commission on the Status of Women WHO, 1998.
- Cour des Comptes, *Les Personnes âgées dépendants, rapport au président de la république suivi des réponses des administrations et des organismes intéressés*, Journaux Officiels, 2005.
- Debbie Noble-Carr, *Young carers research project, background paper, a Carers Australia project*, Carers Australia, 2002.
- Dementia in Europe, Second AE survey confirms the role of carers and the lack of adequate support*, Dementia in Europe, 2006.
- Department of Health, Newzealand, *Aged care literature review, coordination and integration of services*, DH, 2001.
- Dominique Anxo, *Parental leave in European companies, establishment survey on work-*

- ing time 2004-2005, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 2007.
- Ecole National d'Administration, Les Politiques sociales et l'entourage des personnes âgées dépendants, ENA, 2002.
- Elizabeth Mestheneos and Judith Triantafillou, Carers talking: interviews with family carers of older, dependent people in the European Community, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 1993.
- Embargoed Until, The Hidden face of care: combining work and caring responsibilities for the aged and people with a disability, Taskforce on Care Costs, 2007.
- EUROCARERS, Putting informal care on the EU policy agenda, EUROCARERS, 2005.
- EUROFAMCARE, Services for supporting family carers of older dependent people in Europe: characteristics, coverage and usage, EUROFAMCARE, 2006.
- , Services for supporting family carers of elderly people in Europe: characteristics, coverage and usage, summary of main findings from Eurofamcare, EUROFAMCARE, 2006.
- European Commission, Long-term care in the European Union, European Commission, 2007.
- The European Older People's Platform, Study of the impact of EU policies on family carers, The European Older People's Platform, 2004.
- Francesca Bettio and Sacha Prechal, Care in Europe, joint report of the gender and the employment and the gender and law groups of experts, European Commission, 1998.
- Francis McGlone and Natalie Cronin, A Crisis in care? the future of family and state care for older people in the European Union, Family Policy Studies Centre, 1994.
- Frederic Lesemann and Claude Martin, Les Personnes âgées dépendants, soins et solidarités familiales, comparaisons internationales, La Documentation Française, 1993.
- Frits Tjadens and als, Long-term care in other countries- lessons for the Netherlands, Netherlands Institute for Care and Welfare, 2005.
- Garry Halliday, To Investigate the possibilities of using the recent research in positive psychology and laughter to affect the resilience of Australian family carers, The Winston Churchill Memorial Trust of Australia, 2005.
- Gerda Neyer, Family policies and fertility in Europe: fertility policies at the intersection of gender policies, employment policies and care policies, Max Planck Institute for Demographic Research, 2006.

- Hanneli Döhner, Carers organization(s) in Europe: need, existence, objectives, success, 3<sup>rd</sup> global patients congress, 20-22 February, Budapest, University Medical Centre Hamburg-Eppendorf, 2007.
- , Family care of older people in Europe, summary of results of EUROFAMCARE, research benefits for the ageing population: a conference for the dissemination of European research results, 14-15 September in Helsinki, EUROFAMCARE, 2006.
- Hanneli Döhner and Christopher Kofahl, Supporting family carers of older people in Europe- empirical evidence, policy trends and future perspectives, EUROFAMCARE, 2005.
- Hanneli Döhner and Eva Mnich, Ten years long-term care insurance (LTCI) in Germany, consequences on the situation of family care, Prague days of Gerontology, 31<sup>st</sup> May-2<sup>nd</sup> June 2006, EUROFAMCARE, 2006.
- Hannelore Jani-Le Bris, Family care of dependent older people in the European Community, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 1993.
- HelpAge International, Committed to caring, older women and HIC & AIDS in Cambodia, Thailand and Vietnam, HelpAge International, 2007.
- Hoffmann M. and Leeson G, Workplace policies and initiatives to support workers who are carers, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 1993.
- HSCNews International, The Views of health and social campaigners worldwide, the international carers' movement, HSCNews International, Issue 33, November 2006.
- International Social Security Association, Ageing and social security: ten key issues, a contribution by the international social security association to the implementation of the Madrid international plan of action on ageing, ISSA, 2003.
- , Social security programs throughout the world: Europe, 2006, ISSA, 2006.
- J. Jenson and S. Jacobzone, Care allowance for the frail elderly and their impact on women care-givers, OECD, 2000.
- Jane Lethbridge, Care services in Europe, Public Services International Research Unit, 2005.
- Janice Keefe and als, Developing new strategies to support future caregivers of the aged in Canada: projections of need and their policy implications, SEDAP, Research paper No. 140, 2005.

- Janice Keefe and Pamela Fancey, Compensating family caregivers: an analysis of tax initiatives and pension schemes, *Health Law Journal*, Vol. 7, 1999.
- Janice Keefe, Pamela Fancey and Sheri White, Consultation on financial compensation initiatives for family caregivers of dependent adults, final report, Mount Saint Vincent University, 2005.
- Jean Georges, Social support for people with dementia and their carers in Europe, *Alzheimer Europe*, 2007.
- Jens Albert and Ulrich Kohler, Health and care in an enlarged Europe, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 2004.
- Jens Bonke and Elke Koch-Weser, The Welfare state and time allocation, Denmark, Italy, France & Sweden, Working Paper 9, The Danish National Institute of Social Research, 2001.
- Joan O' Conne, Exploring the research and policy gaps: a review of literature on women and disability, exploring the research and policy gaps, University College Dublin, 2006.
- Joyce Cavaye, Hidden carers, Dunedin Academic Press, 2006.
- Judith Eleri Phillips, Working and caring, developments at the workplace for family carers of disability and older people, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 1996.
- Judy Triantafillou and Elizabeth Mestheneos, Examples of good and innovative practices in supporting family carers in Europe, EUROFAMCARE, 2006.
- Judy Triantafillou and als, Family care of older people in Europe, services for supporting family carers of elderly people in Europe: characteristics, coverage and usage, EUROFAMCARE, 2005.
- Julia Twigg, Informal care in Europe, proceedings of a conference held in York, The University of York, 1993.
- Jurate Macijauskienė, Can technology help people with dementia and their carers? Kaunas University of Medicine, Lithuania, 2007.
- K. Bolin and als, Your next of kin or your own career? caring and working among the 50+ of Europe, Tinbergen Institute, Discussion paper, 2007.
- Kai Leichsenring, Providing integrated health and social care for older persons- a European overview, European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research, 2003.
- Kimberly J. Morgan and Katherin Zippel, Paid to care: the origins and effects of care leave

- policies in Western Europe, *Social Politics*, Spring 2003.
- Linda Lysne, *Creating strategies to support Canada's family caregivers 2007 and beyond*, a discussion paper for a consultation meeting hosted by The J. W. McConnell Family Foundation, The J. W. McConnell Family foundation, 2007.
- Linda Pickard, *Policy options for informal carers of elderly people*, in *The Royal Commission on Long Term Care, With Respect to old age: long term care- rights and responsibilities, community care and informal care*, Research Volume 3, TSO, 1999.
- M. A. G. A. Steenvoorden and als, *Family care of the older elderly: casebook of initiatives*, European Foundation for the Improvement of Living and Working Conditions, 1993.
- Madonna Harrington Meyer, *Care work, gender, labor and the welfare state*, Routledge, 2000.
- Manfred Huber, *Long-term care for older people: the future of social services of general interest in the European Union*, European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research, Discussion paper, 2007.
- Marie-Eve Joel and als, *Dépendance et solidarites mieux aider les personnes âgées*, La France, l'Europe-Xeme plan 1989-1992, La Documentation Française, 1991.
- Marja Pijl, *Developments in the support of carers, in Finland, England and the Netherlands, 1998-2002*, Socialstyrelsen, 2003.
- Martin Knapp and als, *Dementia: international comparisons, summary report for the National Audit Office*, PSSRU, 2007.
- Mary Daly, *Care work, the quest for security*, ILO, 2001.
- Mary Daly and Katherine Rake, *Gender and the welfare state*, The Policy Press, 2003.
- Mary Daly and Sara Clavero, *Contemporary family policy in Ireland and Europe*, Queen's University, 2004.
- Mary Jo Gibson, *European experiences with long-term care, France, the Netherlands, Norway, and the United Kingdom*, AARP, 2006.
- Mary Jo Gibson and Donald L. Redfoot, *Comparing long-term care in Germany and the United States: what can we learn from each other?* AARP, 2007.
- , *Long-term care in Developed nationas: a brief overview*, AARP, 2003.
- Michal Arend, *Problems and needs of working carers for older people- potentials and contribution of ICT*, workshop: *ICT contribution to occupational opportunities and work-life-balance of informal carers for older people*, Brussels, 30 November 2006, E-Inclusion EU, 2006.

- Mohamadou Ormarou Danni, Enquête auprès des aidants familiaux des personnes âgées en perte d'autonomie, Université de Poitier, 2007.
- Morton Warner and als, European transnational Alzheimer's study (ETSA), European analysis of public health policy development for Alzheimer's disease and associated disorders of older people and their carers, University of Glamorgan, 1998.
- Mount Saint Vincent University, Policy profiles for caregivers: ten countries, Mount Saint Vincent university, 2005.
- National Alliance for Caregiving, Third international conference on family care, October 12-14, 2002, NAC, 2002.
- , International caregiving legislation, NAC, 2004.
- Northern Ireland Assembly, The Carers's allowance bill 2008, Northern Ireland Assembly, 2008.
- NOVARTIS, La Letter de la proximologie, la situation des aidants a travers le monde, NOVARTIS, 2007.
- Patricia Finucane and als, Support services for carers of elderly people living at home, National Council for the Elderly, 1994.
- Patrick Hennessy, Caring for frail elderly people, new direction in care, OECD, 1994.
- , Caring for frail elderly people, policies in evolution, OECD, 1996.
- Prue Chamberlayne and Anntte King, Culture of care, biographies of carers in Britain and the two Germanies, The Policy Press, 2000.
- Rossana Trifiletti and als, Work and care in double front carer families, a qualitative comparison of care arrangements in Finland, France, Italy, Portugal and the UK, Workpackage 5, SOCCARE, 2003.
- Saul Becker, Global perspectives on children's unpaid caregiving in the family: research and policy on young carers in the UK, Australia, the United States and Sub-Saharan Africa, Global Social Policy, Vol. 7, No. 1, 2007.
- Saul Becker, Jo Aldridge and als, Young carers in Europe, an exploratory cross-national study in Britain, France, widen and Germany, Loughborough University, 1995.
- Saul Becker, Jo Aldridge and Chirs Dearden, Young carers and their families, Blackwell Science, 1998.
- Sophie Moullin, Just care? a fresh approach to adult services, Institute for Public Policy Research, 2008.

- Stefanos Grammenos, Feasibility study- comparable statistics in the area of care of dependent adults in the European Union, European Commission, 2003.
- Steven H. Zarit, Respite services for caregivers, Pennsylvania State University, 2002.
- Sue Armstrong, Caring for carers, managing stress in those who care for people with HIV and AIDS, UNAIDS, 2000.
- Susan Kell Associates, Parental leave and carers leave: international provision and research, report for the Department of Labour, Department of Labour, 2007.
- Susan Lilley, Policies for aging populations: an international perspective, prepared for Population and Public Health Branch Atlantic Regional Office, Health Canada, Health Canada, 2002.
- Susanne Kohler and als, European carers network, carers charter and carers day, EUROFAM-CARE, 2006.
- Tarja K. Viitanen, Informal and formal care in Europe, Institute for the Study of Labor, 2007.
- Taskforce on Care Costs, Where are we now? 2006 interim review of the 2005 creating choice: employment and the cost of care report, Taskforce on Care Costs, 2006.
- Teppo Kroger, Comparative research on social care, the state of the art, SOCCARE, 2001.
- , Families, work and social care in Europe, a qualitative study of care arrangements in Finland, France, Italy, Portugal and the UK, SOCCARE, 2003.
- Tiina Audio, Caring in Finland, EUROCARERS conference in Paris, 28<sup>th</sup> June 2007, EUROCARERS, 2007.
- Tine Rostgaard and Torben Fridberg, Caring for children and older people- a comparisons of European policies and practices, social security in Europe 6, the Danish National Institute of Social Research, 1998.
- Ute Behning, Changing long-term care regimes: a six-country comparison of directions and effects, in Birgit Pfau-Effinger and Birgit Geissler, Care and social integration in European societies, The Policy Press, 2005.
- United Nations Development for Social Policy and Development, Programme on Ageing, Caregiving and older persons-gender dimensions, expert group meeting, Malta, 30 November-2 December 1997, UN Development for Social Policy and Development, 1997.
- World Health Organization, Towards an international consensus on policy for long-term care of the ageing, WHO, 2000.