Difficulty order of fourteen different types of wh-questions in English by Japanese high school students : A preliminary study

Difficulty order of fourteen different types of *wh*-questions in English by Japanese high school students
− A preliminary study −

Tomohiko SHIRAHATA[1] & Shuhei OGAWA[2]

Abstract:

This is a preliminary study attempting to construct difficulty orders of English grammatical items. Our final purpose is to create "learning indicators" for Japanese learners of English（JLEs）when they study English. Based on this attempt, the purpose of this study is to examine what kind of *wh*-question structures are difficult or easy for JLEs to acquire. That is, by selecting fourteen different types of *wh*-questions in English, we attempted to clarify which *wh*-structures were difficult or easy for JLEs to acquire. Another purpose is to examine the relationship between the difficulty order obtained from the study and the number of times these structures appear in junior high school textbooks. That is, we examined whether *wh*-question structures which appear frequently in the textbooks were easier for JLEs to acquire than those which appear infrequently. The participants of the study were 38 first-year senior high school students who used the English textbook, *Total English* when they were in junior high school. The research results indicate that there is no relation between difficulty orders of *wh*-questions and the number of times they appear in the English textbooks. Moreover, subject *wh*-questions（both *who* and *what*）are fairly difficult for JLEs compared with the other *wh*-questions.

1. Introduction

This is a preliminary study for attempting to construct difficulty orders of English grammatical items. Thus, our final goal is to create "learning indicators" for Japanese learners of English（JLEs）when they study English. This is our final, long-term destination. Then, the purpose of this study is to examine what kind of *wh*-question structures are difficult or easy for JLEs to acquire. That is, by selecting fourteen different types of *wh*-questions in English, we are going to clarify which structures among them are difficult or easy for JLEs to acquire. Another purpose is to examine the relationship between the difficulty order obtained from the study and the number of times these structures appear in junior high school textbooks. That is, we will examine whether *wh*-question types which appear frequently in the textbooks are easier for JLEs to acquire than those which appear

---

[1] 英語教育系列

[2] 教育学研究科学校教育研究専攻英語教育専修

infrequently.

　JLEs make many kinds of grammatical errors in producing *wh*-questions. For example, in a case we ask "a car" like (1a), we must make a syntactic structure as shown in (1b). However, JLEs do not always produce this form. Examples from (1c) through (1e) are errors JLEs have produced. They sometimes misuse a *be*-verb instead of using a correct *do* auxiliary form as shown in (1c), while the other time, they produce a structure with no *do*-support as an example of (1e) shows. In this way, JLEs make various kinds of grammatical errors when they acquire *wh*-question formations.

(1)　a. John bought <u>a car</u> last Monday.
　　　b. What did John buy last Monday?
　　　c. What was John buy last Monday?
　　　d. What do John bought last Monday?
　　　e. What John bought last Monday?

　This paper is organized as follows. After the introduction, we briefly summarize the theoretical backgrounds of *wh*-questions in both Japanese and English in Section 2. Then, in Section 3 we will count the numbers of *wh*-questions appeared in the textbooks which junior high school student use. In Section 4, we show our experiment which investigates the acquisition of *wh*-questions by the first-year senior high school students. Then, results and discussion follow in Section 5. In Section 6, we will summarize our study.

2. Backgrounds

　Let us summarize linguistic differences between Japanese and English *wh*-questions. In Japanese *wh*-question formations, *wh*-elements do not have to move to the top of the sentence, which is called a CP-spec position. They can remain at the original position in the declarative sentences. In (2b), *chokoreeto* (=chocolate) is replaced with *nani* (= what). In (2c), *Tokyo* is replaced with *doko* (= where). In (2d), the word *Mary* is replaced with *dare* (= who).

(2)　a. Mary-ga　　chokoreeto-o　　kinoo　　　Tokyo-de katta.
　　　　Mary-Nom　chocolate-Acc　yesterday　Tokyo-in bought
　　　　　　"Mary bought some chocolate in Tokyo yesterday."
　　　b. Mary-ga　<u>nani-o</u>　　kinoo　　　Tokyo-de katta　　ka/no.
　　　　Mary-Nom　what-Acc　yesterday　Tokyo-in　bought　Q
　　　　　　"What did Mary buy in Tokyo yesterday?"
　　　c. Mary-ga　　chokoreeto-o　　kinoo　　　<u>doko-de</u>　katta　ka/no.
　　　　Mary-Nom　chocolate-Acc　yesterday　where-in　bought　Q
　　　　　　"Where did Mary buy some chocolate yesterday?"
　　　d. Mary-ga　　chokoreeto-o　　<u>itsu</u>　　Tokyo-de　katta　ka/no.

Mary-Nom　chocolate-Acc　when　Tokyo-in　bought　Q
　　"When did Mary buy some chocolate in Tokyo?"
e. <u>Dare-ga</u>　chokoreeto-o　kinoo　　　Tokyo-de　katta　ka/no.
　　who-Nom　chocolate-Acc　yesterday　Tokyo-in　bought　　Q
　　"Who bought some chocolate in Tokyo yesterday?"

Let us examine English wh-questions in turn. When we make an object *wh*-question with a lexical verb in English, a *wh*-phrase must move to the sentence initial position, that is, a CP-spec position, and an auxiliary verb *do* is required, as shown in （3）. This auxiliary insertion is generally called "*do*-support", and the auxiliary *do* must change its form depending on the person, number and tense, and and the tense marking is not necessary for the main verb.

（3）　a. Tom ate <u>sushi</u> for lunch.
　　　b. [CP What$_i$ [C did [TP Tom [VP eat t_i for lunch]]]] ?

On the other hand, in the case that the *wh*-element is a subject, it must also move to the sentence initial position （the CP-spec position）. Although seemingly its word order remains the same as that of a declarative sentence, the *wh*-phrase actually moves from the TP-spec position （the subject position） to the CP-spec position as in （4）. In the subject *wh*-question, the *do*-support is not required.

（4）[CP Who [C φ [TP t [VP met John at the party]]]] ?

3. Textbook analysis

When we examine the JLEs' acquisition of *wh*-questions, it is important to analyze how many times a certain *wh*-question appears in the English textbooks they use. These JLEs study English at school and receive English input mainly through their English textbooks. Thus, since the linguistic input from the textbooks is a major source of English they receive, it should be important to analyze the numbers of times each *wh*-questions appear in the textbooks. The English textbooks we analyze in this study are *Total English, New Crown, New Horizon*, and *Sunshine*. These textbook versions are the ones used from 2012 through 2015 academic years in Japan. They are not the textbooks used in 2016. We will extract all the *wh*-question sentences in these textbooks.

As our first step, we will divide all the *wh*-questions into five subcategories according to the types of *wh*-words: *what, who, where, when* and *why*. We do not include *which* in this study. This research is called Textbook Analysis 1. The participants of the experiment in the current study are the first-year senior high school students, and all of them used *Total English* when they were in junior high school. Thus, as Textbook Analysis 2, we will narrow down our analysis to *Total English* only.

Table 1 shows the results of Textbook Analysis 1. From the results, we have found that

the textbook that *wh*-questions appear the most is *Sunshine*, which has 301 *wh*-questions in total. The second is *New Crown* with 224 *wh*-questions. The third is *Total English* with 175 sentences. The least is *New Horizon* with 163 sentences. *Sunshine* contains 1.84 times as many *wh*-questions as those in *New Horizon*. Thus, we have found that there are big differences in the number of times in *wh*-questions among the four English textbooks.

　　Throughout all the textbooks, we have also found that *what* appears the most. There are 568 *what*-questions in total. The second is *where* with 105 times, the third is *when* with 72 times, the fourth is *who* with 69 times and the least is *why* with 54 times in total. We have found that the frequency of *what* is more than ten times as many as *why*.

Table 1.

Total numbers of five *wh*-questions in junior high school textbooks

	Total English	*New Crown*	*New Horizon*	*Sunshine*	Total
What	107 (61.1%)	163 (72.8%)	102 (62.6%)	196 (65.1%)	568
Where	28 (16.0%)	16 (7.1%)	19 (11.7%)	40 (13.3%)	105
Who	16 (9.1%)	16 (7.1%)	19 (11.7%)	18 (6.0%)	69
When	12 (6.9%)	19 (8.5%)	17 (10.4%)	23 (7.6%)	72
Why	12 (6.9%)	10 (4.4%)	6 (3.7%)	24 (8.0%)	54
Total	175 (100%)	224 (100%)	163 (100%)	301 (100%)	

　　Table 2 shows the numbers of times *wh*-questions appear according to syntactic structures of *wh*-questions. The structure, $What_i+BE+S+t_i$? appears the most with 58 (33.1%) occurrences. The structure, $What_i+DO+S+V+t_i$? appears the second with 43 (24.6%) sentences. It was found that these two structures are major *wh*-question structures for junior high school students. The percentage rates of the other ten *wh*-questions are all below 10% occurrences. That is to say, the structure, $Where_i+DO+S+V+t_i$? is in the third with 15 (8.6%) occurrences. The structure, $Who_i+DO+S+V+t_i$? , is the least with only one occurrences, There are only a few subject *wh*-questions in the textbooks. There are six (3.4%) subject *what*-questions and four subject *who*-questions (2.2%). We have found that there are great differences of frequencies of syntactic structures in *wh*-questions that appear in *Total English*.

Table 2.

Total numbers and their percentages of *wh*-questions by structures in *Total English*

level	item	structure	number (%)
30% level	What	$What_i+BE+S+t_i$	58 (33.1%)
20% level	What	$What_i+DO+S+V+t_i$	43 (24.6%)
Below 10%	Where	$Where_i+DO+S+V+t_i$	15 (8.6%)
	Where	$Where_i+BE+S+t_i$	13 (7.4%)
	Who	$Who_i+BE+S+t_i$	11 (6.3%)

	Why	Why$_i$+DO+S+V+t$_i$	10（ 5.7%)
	When	When$_i$+DO+S+V+t$_i$	9（ 5.1%)
	What	What$_i$+t$_i$ +V	6（ 3.4%)
	Who	Who$_i$+t$_i$ +V	4（ 2.2%)
	When	When$_i$+BE+S+t$_i$	3（ 1.7%)
	Why	Why$_i$+BE+S+t$_i$	2（ 1.1%)
	Who	Who$_i$+DO+S+V+t$_i$	1（ 0.6%)
	Total		175 (100%)

4. Experiment

4.1 Participants

　Participants of this study were 38 first-year students at the same senior high school. As was mentioned before, these first-year students received their English input mostly from the textbooks used at junior high school. All the participants used *Total English* when they were in junior high school.

4.2 Test Material

　We made multiple-choice questions as a test material: three errors and one correct choice questions according to the syntactic structures. Let us show the details of the choices of *wh*-questions below. An example of object *wh*-questions is shown in (5). Choice 1 is an auxiliary substitution error. Choice 2 is a lack of auxiliary error. Choice 3 is a no movement error. Choice 4 is a grammatically correct sentence. In (6), we show an example of *wh*-questions from subject position, and in (7), an example of *wh*-questions of an extraction from the subject complement is demonstrated. In (6), Choice 1 is an error of overuse of *DO*. Choice 2 is an error of overuse of *DO+it*. Choice 3 is an error of overuse of *BE*. In (7), Choice 1 is a substitution of auxiliary error. Choice 2 is a lack of auxiliary error. Choice 3 is an overuse of *it* as a subject error.

(5)　An example of object *wh*-questions

　　Wh-$_i$+DO+S+V+t$_i$?　(e.g.: What do you want?)

　　　Choice 1: auxiliary substitution error (e.g., What are you want?)

　　　Choice 2: lack of auxiliary error (e.g., What you want?)

　　　Choice 3: no movement error (e.g., You want what?)

　　　Choice 4: correct (e.g., What do you want?)

(6)　An example of subject *wh*-questions

　　Wh-$_i$ +t$_i$+V+O?　　(e.g.: What interests you about Japan?)

　　　Choice 1: overuse error of *DO* (e.g., What does interest you about Japan?)

　　　Choice 2: overuse error of *DO+ it* (e.g., What does it interest you about Japan?)

　　　Choice 3: overuse error of *BE* (e.g., What is interest you about Japan?)

　　　Choice 4: correct (e.g., What interests you about Japan?)

（7）An example of *wh*-questions from subject complements

Wh-ᵢ +tᵢ+BE+PP　（e.g.: What is in the box?）

    Choice 1: substitution of *BE* verb error （e.g., What does in the box?）

    Choice 2: lack of *BE* verb error （e.g., What in the box?）

    Choice 3: overuse of *it* as a subject error （e.g., What is it in the box?）

    Choice 4: correct （e.g., What is in the box?）

4.3 Procedure

We divided *wh*-questions into 14 different types: Type 1 through Type 14. They are shown in Table 4 through Table 8. Each type has four questions: two types have present tense and the other two types have past tense. Thus, we made 56 *wh*-questions plus 21 filler questions altogether.

5. Results and discussion of the experiment

Let us look at the overall results of the experiment. Table 3 shows results of correct percentages of the five *wh*-phrases, *what*, *who*, *where*, *why* and *when*. From the results, we realize that there are great differences among the percentages of the five *wh*-phrases. Look at *What* and *Where*. The percentage of *What* is 70.7% and that of *Where* is 94.1%. There is a 23.4% gap between them. We have no choice but to say that there are differences of correct answers among the *wh*-phrases. *Where* and *When* are at 90% levels, and *Why* is at 80% level, and *What* and *Who* are at 70% levels.

Table 3.

Results of correct percentages of five *wh*-questions (%)

Wh 疑問文	No. of correct	Correct（%）
Where?	430/608	94.1%
When?	486/608	90.1%
Why?	286/304	83.1%
Who?	274/304	79.9%
What?	221/266	70.7%

Now, tables from 4 through 8 show the results of percentages of corrects and errors according to the syntactic structures among the 14 *wh*-questions. Table 4 shows the results of four different types of *what*-questions. From the results, it was found that Type 3 （subject *what*-question） is extremely difficult for the JLEs. The percentage of correct is 27.0%, which is consequently the worst correct percentage among the 14 *wh*-questions. In Table 5, we list the results of *who*-questions. Again, the correct percentage of subject *who*-question （Type 7） show a low achievement （47.4%）. Table 6 shows the results of two types of *where*-questions, and both scores are over 90% accuracy. Table 7 shows the results of two types of *when*-questions. The correct percentages of these two structures are high （92.8% for Type 11 and 87.5% for Type 12）.

Then, Table 8 shows the results of two types of *why*-questions. Compared with other structures, the result of Type 14 indicates low score (73.7%). We suppose that this is due to a word "late." Below is the test context we used for Type 14. We used "late" in the experiment, and after the experiment was finished, we suppose that many participants might think that "late" was a verb. In Japanese, we use "okureru" for "be late." But, "okureru" ends with "ru," which is coincidentally equivalent to a Japanese verb ending morpheme,"(r)u." We suppose that many JLEs misunderstand that "late" is a verb. That is why many of the participants chose Choice 1.

> Q : MaryはHirotoにどうして学校に遅れた（late for school）のか尋ねます。
>
> 　　Mary:（1.　Why did you late for school　2.　Why were you late for school
>
> 　　　　　3.　Why you late for school　4.　You were late for school why）today?
>
> 　　Hiroto: I got up late today.（ get up late 寝坊する）

Table 4.

Results of *What*-Questions

Type & Structures	Correct	Frequency in textbooks
Type 1: $What_i$ + do + S + V+ t_i	94.7% (144/152)	43
Type 2: $What_i$ + be + S + t_i	90.1% (137/152)	58
Type 3: $What_i$ + t_i + V + O	27.0% (41/152)	3
Type 4: $What_i$ + t_i + be + PP	71.1% (108/152)	3

Table 5.

Results of *Who*-Questions

Structures	Correct	Frequency in textbooks
Type 5: Who_i + do + S +V + t_i	82.2% (125/152)	1
Type 6: Who_i + be + S + t_i	97.4% (148/152)	11
Type 7: Who_i + t_i + V + + O	47.4% (72/152)	4
Type 8: Who + t_i + be + PP	92.8% (141/152)	0

Table 6.

Results of *Where*-Questions

Structures	Correct	numbers in textbooks
Type 9: $Where_i$ + do + S + V+ t_i	90.8% (138/152)	15
Type 10: $Where_i$ + be + S + t_i	97.4% (148/152)	13

Table 7.

Results of *When*-Questions

Structures	Correct	numbers in textbooks
Type 11: When$_i$ + do + S + V+ t$_i$	92.8% （141/152）	9
Type 12: When$_i$ + be + S + t$_i$	87.5% （133/152）	3

Table 8.

Results of *Why*-Questions

Structures	Correct	numbers in textbooks
Type 13: Why$_i$ + do + S + V+ t$_i$	90.1% （137/152）	10
Type 14: Why$_i$ + be + S + t$_i$	73.7% （ 84/114）	2

Now, let us look at Table 9. It shows difficulty order of the 14 different types of *wh*-questions, which is a major theme of this study. Eight （Types 6, 10, 1, 8, 11, 9, 2 and 13） out of 14 types hold over 90% accuracy level, two （Types 12 and 5） are at 80% level, and two （types 4 and 14） are at 70% level. Roughly speaking, we could say that these types are not relatively difficult for JLEs. The point is that JLEs have difficulty judging grammaticality of subject wh-questions. Type 7 is a subject *who*-question, and its correct rate is 47.4%, while Type 3, which is a subject *what*-question, shows only 27.0% correct rate. These figures can indicate that subject *wh*-questions are very difficult for JLEs.

Table 9.

Difficulty order of the 14 different types of *wh*-questions

	Structures	Correct	numbers
90% level	Type 6: Who$_i$ + be + S + t$_i$ (e.g.: Who was in the classroom?)	97.4% (148/152)	11
	Type 10: Where$_i$ + be + S + t$_i$ (e.g.: Where were you last night?)	97.4% (148/152)	13
	Type 1: What$_i$ + do + S + V+ t$_i$ (e.g.: What do you want?)	94.7% (144/152)	43
	Type 8: Who$_i$ + t$_i$ + be + PP (e.g.: Who was in the classroom?)	92.8% (141/152)	0
	Type 11: When$_i$ + do + S + V+ t$_i$ (e.g.: When did you go to Kyoto?)	92.8% (141/152)	9
	Type 9: Where$_i$ + do + S + V+ t$_i$ (e.g.: Where did you go yesterday?)	90.8% (138/152)	15
	Type 2: What$_i$ + be + S + t$_i$ (e.g.: What is your blood type?)	90.1% (137/152)	58
	Type 13: Why$_i$ + do + S + V+ t$_i$ (e.g.: Why did you buy the car?)	90.1% (137/152)	10
80% level	Type 12: When$_i$ + be + S + t$_i$ (e.g.: When is your birthday?)	87.5% (133/152)	3

	Type 5: Who_i + do + S +V + t_i (e.g.: Why did you meet yesterday?)	82.2% (125/152)	1
70% level	Type 4: $What_i$ + t_i + be + PP (e.g.: What is in the box?)	71.1% (108/152)	3
	Type 14: Why_i + be + S + t_i (e.g.: Why were you late for school?)	73.70% (84/114)	2
40% level	Type 7: Who_i + t_i + V + + O (e.g.: Who bought the bike?)	47.40% (72/152)	4
20% level	Type 3: $What_i$ + t_i + V + O (e.g.: What interests you about Japan?)	27.00% (41/152)	3

Table 10 and Table 11 show error types of the 14 *wh*-questions. Here, let us focus on the errors for subject *wh*-questions at Table 11. We list an example of subject *what*-question and an example of subject *who*-question respectively. From the JLEs' results, it could be said that JLEs think awkward when there is no *do*-support in *wh*-questions. They are comfortable when there is some element in the CP-head position (e.g., *do*, *does*, *did* or *am*, *is*, *are*, etc). Also it could be assumed that there is some animacy effect in the subject noun. L2 learners may think that sentential subjects should be animate because a subject does something expressed by a verb in the sentence. Thus, living things, especially human beings are better than non-living things for the subject position. We have to examine this issue in more detail in the near future.

⑻ Subject *what*-question:

MaryはKeitaに悲しんでいる理由を尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What is make　2.　What does it make you　3.　What makes you

4.　What does make）so sad?

Keita: My pet passed away yesterday.（pass away…「死ぬ」の婉曲的表現）

⑼ Subject *who*-question:

MaryはKazukiに誰が窓をわったのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who broke　2.　Who did broke　3.　Who did it break

4.　Who was break）the window?

Kazuki: Naoki.

Table 10.

Error types of 10 *wh*-questions

	Correct	Agreement error	Lack of aux error	No movement error
Who+BE+S	148/152 (97.4%)	2/152 (1.3%)	2/152 (1.3%)	0/152 (0.0%)
Where+BE+S	148/152 (97.4%)	4/152 (2.6%)	0/152 (0.0%)	0/152 (0.0%)
What+DO+S+V	144/152 (94.7%)	5/152 (3.3%)	3/152 (2.0%)	0/152 (0.0%)
When+DO+S+V	141/152 (92.8%)	10/152 (6.6%)	0/152 (0.0%)	1/152 (0.7%)
Where+DO+S+V	138/152 (90.8%)	8/152 (5.3%)	6/152 (3.9%)	0/152 (0.0%)
Why+DO+S+V	137/152 (90.1%)	7/152 (4.6%)	8/152 (5.3%)	0/152 (0.0%)
What+BE+S	137/152 (90.1%)	5/152 (3.3%)	9/152 (5.9%)	1/152 (0.7%)
When+BE+S	133/152 (87.5%)	12/152 (7.9%)	5/152 (3.3%)	2/152 (1.3%)
Who+DO+S+V	125/152 (82.2%)	18/152 (11.8%)	9/152 (5.9%)	0/152 (0.0%)
Why+BE+S	84/114 (73.7%)	23/114 (20.2%)	6/114 (5.3%)	0/114 (0.0%)

Table 11.

Error types of subject *wh*-questions

	Correct	Overuse of *DO*	Overuse of *DO* it	Overuse of *BE*
Who+V+O	72/152 (47.4%)	50/152 (32.9%)	15/152 (9.9%)	15/152 (9.9%)
What+V+O	41/152 (27.0%)	51/152 (33.6%)	22/152 (14.5%)	38/152 (25.0%)

Table 12.

Error types of *wh*-questions+BE+PP

	Correct	Agreement error	Lack of *BE* error	Overuse of *it*
Who+BE+PP	141/152 (92.8%)	0/152 (0.0%)	5/152 (3.3%)	6/152 (3.9%)
What+BE+PP	108/152 (71.1%)	3/152 (2.0%)	2/152 (1.3%)	39/152 (25.7%)

6. Short summary

We have examined JLEs' acquisition of *wh*-questions. We divided *wh*-questions into 14 different types in accordance with their syntactic and semantic differences. Our main findings are the followings. First, there is no relation between difficulty orders of *wh*-questions and the number of times they appear in the English textbooks. Second, subject *wh*-questions (both *who* and *what*) are very difficult for JLEs compared with the results of the other *wh*-questions.

In addition to investigating difficulty order of *wh*-questions, this has been our first attempt (so, it is a preliminary study) to attempt to construct difficulty orders of English grammatical items. The purpose is to create "learning indicators" for JLEs when they study English.

Appendix: Test Material

(We list all the questions and contexts we used for the experiment except distractors in order for anyone to duplicate the same kind of experiment and confirm our test results.)

（1）Mary は Hiroto にどうして学校に遅れた（late for school）のか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Why did you late for school 2. Why were you late for school

3. Why you late for school 4. You were late for school why）today?

Hiroto: I got up late today（get up late 寝坊する）

（3）Mary は Toshi に向こうで立っている少年は誰か尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Who is the boy 2. The boy is who 3. Who the boy 4. Who does the boy）standing over there?

Toshi: Shuhei.

（5）Mary は Hikaru にこの教室の責任者は誰か尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Who does in charge of 2. Who in charge of 3. Who is it in charge of

4. Who is in charge of）this classroom?

Hikaru: Mr. Kitamura is.

（6）Mary は Eita の誕生日はいつか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. When your birthday 2. When do your birthday 3. When is your birthday 4. Your birthday is when）?

Eita: July 18.

（8）Mary は Kaede に教室に誰がいたか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Who did in the classroom 2. Who was in the classroom

3. Who in the classroom 4. Who was it in the classroom）?

Kaede: Mr. Kitamura was.

（10）Mary は Kaito に日本の首都（the capital of Japan）はどこか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Where does the capital of Japan 2. Where the capital of Japan

3. The capital of Japan is where 4. Where is the capital of Japan）?

Kaito: Tokyo.

（12）Mary は Keita に悲しんでいる理由を尋ねます。

Mary:（1. What is make 2. What does it make you 3. What makes you

4. What does make）so sad?

Keita: My pet passed away yesterday.（pass away…死ぬの婉曲的表現）

（13）Mary は Kazuki に誰が窓を割ったのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Who broke 2. Who did broke 3. Who did it break

4. Who was break）the window?

Kazuki: Naoki.

（15）Mary は Tomoya に誰が学級委員長（class president）に当選（win the election）したか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. Who does it win 2. Who does win 3. Who wins 4. Who is win）the election of the class president?

Tomoya: Maybe John.

（18）Mary は Shuehi に、いつ夏休みの宿題を終えたか尋ねます。

Mary:（1. When did you finish 2. When you finish 3. When was you finish

4. You finished when）your homework?

Shuhei: On August 31.

（19）Mary は Daisuke に AKB の誰に投票するのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who you vote for　2.　Who are you vote for　3.　Who do you vote for
　　　4.　You vote for who）？

Daisuke: For Yuko Oshima.

（20）Mary は Tubasa の血液型について尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What is your blood type　2.　What your blood type
　　　　3.　What your blood type　4.　What do your blood type?）？

Tubasa: It's B.

（21）Mary は Souta に夏休みにしたことについて尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What you do　2.　What did you do　3.　What were you do
　　　　4.　You did what）on summer vacation?

Souta: I played soccer with my friend.

（22）Mary は Ryota にどうして蛍（fireflies）はすぐ死んでしまうのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Why fireflies die　2.　Why do fireflies die　3.　Fireflies die why
　　　　4.Why are fireflies die）so early?

Ryota: I don't know.

（25）Mary は Tatsuya にどうして今日はこんなに暑いのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Why it so hot　2.　Why is it so hot　3.　It is so hot why
　　　　4.　Why does it so hot）today?

Tatsuya: Because Shuzo Matsuoka is coming.

（26）Mary は Shun にこれからどこに行くのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Where do you go　2.　Where you go　3.　You go where
　　　　4.　Where are you go）？

Shun: To the SENOVA.

（27）Mary は Rikuto に車に何を積んでいるのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What in the car　2　What is it in the car　3.　What does in the car
　　　　4.　What is in the car）？

Rikuto: A dog is.

（29）Mary は Daiki になぜ夏休みの期間中に学校に行ったのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Why did you go to school　2.　Why you went to the school
　　　　3.　You went to school why　4.　Why were you go to school）
　　　　　during summer vacation?

Daiki: To feed rabbits with foods　　（feed 〜 with 〜にえさをやる）

（30）Mary は Koraro にお味噌汁の具は何か尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What is it in the miso soup　2.　What is in the miso soup
　　　　3.　What in the miso soup　4.　What does in the miso soup）？

Kotaro: Wakame is.

（33）Mary は Aoi に日本のどこが興味深いのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What does it interest　2.　What is interest　3.　What interests
　　　　4.　What does interest）you about Japan?

Aoi: "Wabi Sabi."

（37）Mary は Shingo に去年の担任の先生（classroom teacher）は誰だったか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Your classroom teacher was who　2.　Who was your classroom teacher

3.　Who did your classroom teacher　4.　Who your classroom teacher）？

Shingo: Mr. Kitamura.

（38）Mary は Yamato のお気に入りの（favorite）アイドルグループについて尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What your favorite idol group　2.　Your favorite idol group is what

3.　What is your favorite idol group　4.　What do your favorite idol group）？

Yamato: ARASHI.

（39）Mary は Kentaro にガソリンの価格（the price of gas）はどうして高いのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Why the price of gas high　2.　Why is the price of gas high

3.　The price of gas high why　4.　Why does the price of gas high）？

Kentaro: It's because of tax.（tax 税金）

（40）Mary は、Yuto に、その店はいつ開店するか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　The shop opens when　2.　When does the shop open

3.　When is the shop open　4.　When the shop open）？

Yuto: At 10 AM.

（42）Mary は Daichi に冬休みにどこへ行ったか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Where were you go　2.　Where you go　3.　Where did you go

4.　You went Where）during winter vacation?

Daichi: I went to America.

（43）Mary は Takuma になぜ薬を飲んだのか（take medicine）尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Why you took medicine　2.　Why were you take medicine

3.　You took medicine why　4.　Why did you take）medicine?

Takuma: Because I have a cold.（have a cold 風邪をひいている）

（44）Mary は Syunsuke に駅にだれがいたか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who was it at the station　2.　Who at the station　3.　Who did at the station　4.　Who was at the station）？

Syunsuke: Mr. Kitamura was.

（45）Mary は Hibiki に、いつの間にケーキを食べたのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　When was you eat　2.　When you eat　3.　When did you eat

4.　You eat when）the cake?

Hibiki: Just a few minutes ago.（a few minutes ago 数分前）

（46）Mary は Takumi に昨日誰に会ったのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who did you meet　2.　Who were you meet　3.　You meet who

4.　Who you meet）yesterday?

Takumi: I met my friend.

（47）Mary は Kenta に嵐の中で誰が一番好きか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who you like the best　2.　Who are you like the best

3.　Who you like the best　4.　Who do you like the best）in ARASHI?

Kenta: I like Aiba-kun the best.

（48）Mary は Yuma に、普段いつ勉強するのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　When you study　2.　When are you study　3.　You study when

4.　When do you study）？

Yuma: I usually study after dinner.

（50）Mary は Wataru に何がそんなに Shuhei を悩ませたのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What is bothered　2.　What did it bother　3.　What did bother

　　　4.　What bothered）you so much?

Wataru: I got bitten by a mosquito all night.（get bitten by a mosquito…蚊に食われる）

（51）Mary は Taichi に普段はどこで勉強するのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Where do you study　2.　Where you study　3.　You study where

　　　4.　Where are you study）?

Taichi: At the living.

（53）Mary は Hazime に今年の福男は誰か尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who the Lucky Men　2.　Who does the Lucky Men

　　　3.　Who is the Lucky Men　4.　The Lucky Men is who）this year?

Hazime: It's me!

（54）Mary は Ryota に昼休み（lunch break）はどこにいたのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　You were where　2.　Where you　3.　Where did you

　　　4.　Where were you）during the lunch break?

Ryota: In the gym.

（56）Mary は Souta のお父さんは今どこにいるのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Where is your father　2.　Where does your father　3.　Where your father

　　　4.　Your father is where）now?

Souta: In Yokohama.

（57）Mary は誰が Kazuya にプレゼントをあげたか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who gave a present　2.　Who was give a present　3.　Who did give a

　　　present　4.　Who did it give a present）to you?

Kazuya: My mother.

（58）Mary は Ren に昨夜何をしたのか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　What you do　2.　You did what　3.　What did you do

　　　4.　What were you do）last night?

Ren: I watched the movie 'Ana to yuki no jooh'.

（59）Mary は Zin に、いつ掃除当番（turn to clean）だったか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　When was your turn to clean　2.　When did your turn to clean

　　　3.　Your turn to clean was when　4.　When your turn to clean）?

Zin: Yesterday.

（60）Mary は掃除当番である Ichiro にどこを掃除したのか尋ねます。

Shuhei:（1.　Where were you clean　2.　Where did you clean　3.　Where you clean

　　　4.　You cleaned where）?

Ichiro: In the classroom.

（61）Mary は Takuya に元カノ（ex-girlfriend）は誰だったか尋ねます。

Mary:（1.　Who did the ex-girlfriend　2.　Who was the ex-girlfriend

　　　3.　Who the ex-girlfriend　4.　The ex-girlfriend was who）?

Takuya: It's a secret.

（62）Mary は Yuto に以前は誰と一緒に住んでいたのか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　You lived with who　2.　Who you lived with　3.　Who were you live
        with　4.　Who did you lived with）before?

    Yuto: I lived with my father.

(64) Mary は Hayato にクリスマスプレゼントが何だったか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　Your Chistmas gift was what　2.　What was your Christmas gift
        3.　What your Christmas gift　4．What did your Christmas gift）？

    Hayato: 'Wii U'.

(65) Mary は Zyun になぜ昨日怒っていた（angry）のか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　Why did you so angry　2.　You were angry why　3.　Why you were so
        angry　4.　Why were you do angry）yesterday?

    Zyun: Because I fought with my brother（fight with 〜 〜と喧嘩する）

(66) Mary は Takuya に箱の中身は何だったか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　What was it in the box　2.　What in the box　3.　What was in the box
        4.　What did in the box）？

    Takuya: Two apples was.

(67) Mary は Hinata にスクリーンに何が映ったか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　What was it on the screen　2.　What on the screen
        3.　What did on the screen　4.　What was on the screen）？

    Hinata: A ghost was.

(68) Mary は Tsukasa に誰がクラスの伴奏をするのか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　Who does it play the piano　2.　Who plays the piano
        3.　Who does play the piano　4.　Who is play the piano）in a class?

    Tsukasa: I don't know.

(69) Mary は Shuhei に何が欲しいか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　What do you want　2.　You want what　3.　What you want
        4.　What are you want）？

    Shuhei: Money.

(70) Mary は Iori に今日の日直（day duty）は誰か尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　Who does on day duty　2.　Who is on day duty　3.　Who is it on day
        duty　4.　Who on day duty）？

    Iori. You are.

(71) Mary は Naoki にこどもの日（Children's Day）はいつか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　When the Children's Day　2.　The Children's day is when
        3.　When does the Children's Day　4.　When is the Children's day）？

    Naoki: On May 5.

(72) Mary は Sora にどうしてそんなに英語を勉強するのか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　Why are you study　2.　Why you study　3.　Why do you study
        4.　You study why）English so much?

    Sora: Because I want an American girlfriend.

(73) Mary は Taiyou になぜそんなに時間がかかったのか尋ねます。

    Mary:（1.　What did it take you　2.　What is took you　3.　What did take you
        4.　What took you）so long?

Taiyou: I'm so sorry.

（74）Mary は Sho に子どもの頃の夢について尋ねます。

　Mary（1.　What your dream　2.　Your dream was what　3.　What was your dream
　　　　4.　What did your dream）when you were young?

　Sho: I wanted to be a comedian.　（Comedian お笑い芸人）

（75）Mary は Taro に、体育祭（athletic meet）はいつだったか尋ねます。

　Mary:（1.　When the athletic meet　2.　The athletic meet was when
　　　　3.　When did the athletic meet　4.　When was the athletic meet）？

　Taro: On October 21.

（76）Mary は Ryo が見つけた鍵はどこにあったのか尋ねます。

　Mary:（1.　Where did the key　2.　Where was the key　3.　Where the key
　　　　4.　The key was where）？

　Ryo: In the classroom.

（77）Mary は Shota に放課後の過ごし方について尋ねます。

　Mary:（1.　What do you do　2.　What you do　3.　What do you do　4.　You do
　　　　what）after school?

　Shota: I usually go to the library and read books.

References

坂内昌徳（2006）.「Wh 移動の制約」若林茂則（編著）『第二言語習得研究入門　生成文法から
　のアプローチ』東京：新曜社

Cook, J. V.（1988）. *Chomsky's Universal Grammar: An Introduction*. London: Basil Blackwell.
　［翻訳：須賀哲夫（訳）（1990）.『チョムスキーの言語理論 普遍文法入門 東京：新曜社』

笠島準一・関典明（代表）（2013）.『NEW HORIZON English Course 1-3』東京：東京書籍

松畑照一・佐野正行（2013）.『SUNSHINE ENGLISH COURSE 1-3』東京：開隆堂

三原健一（1998）.『生成文法と比較統語論』「WH 句」pp. 112-113. 東京：くろしお出版

白畑知彦・若林茂則・村野井仁（2010）.『詳説　第二言語習得論　理論から研究法まで』東京：
　研究社

高橋貞雄（代表）（2013）.『NEW CROWN 1-3 ENGLISH SERIES』東京：三省堂

矢田裕士・吉田研作（代表）（2013）.『TOTAL ENGLISH 1-3』東京：学校図書